Arlington Historic District Commissions

December 1, 2011 Whittemore Robbins House

FINAL AND APPROVED MINUTES

Commissioners

D. Baldwin, J. Black, J. Cummings, D. Levy, J. Nyberg,

Present:

S. Makowka, M. Penenik, T. Smurzynski, J. Worden

Commissioners

Not Present: M. Logan, B. Cohen

Guests Present: C. Grinnell, C. Grinnell, P. Givertzman, M. Fischer

1. AHDC Meeting Opens

8:00pm

- 2. Appointment of alternate Commissioners; Mt Gilboa/Crescent Hill T. Smurznski, J. Cummings appointed to Mt. Gilboa/Crescent Hill Historic District
- 3. Approval of draft minutes from October 27 meetings. J. Worden moved tabling the minutes until next month. J. Nyberg seconded. Unanimously voted to table until January's meeting (1/26)

4. Communications

- a. Request for informal and CONA application for 187 Lowell Street
- b. Activity at 55 Academy Street Inset lot on Academy Street, Italianate farmhouse whose owner applied to build 1 story addition on rear of house with building dept. Now framed in, no details yet, we became aware of construction and S. Makowka contacted them. No idea how building dept. issued permit without certificate from HDC. No application ever filed with HDC. Owner has been contacted and has been told they need to come in and file an application before going any further ahead with work. Coming in tonight for discussion with Commission and hoping to get permission to continue work.
- c. Activity at 23 Maple Street Paving on side of driveway is brick and issues with safety on uneven bricks. At grade is not under our jurisdiction but we've reached out to C. Kowalski to come up with ideal approach to deal with paved areas around town that will meet safety and historic requirements. Discussion about various solutions from Commissioners. D. Levy and J. Cummings are willing to serve on a sub-committee to investigate options.

5. New Business

Hearings (typically last around 20 minutes per application)

8:20pm

a. Formal Hearing for 7 Westmoreland Ave. (Levy) for installation of skylights. S. Makowka noted that D. Levy has stepped down from Commission and T. Smurznski will step in as voting member for Mt Gilboa/Crescent Hill for the purpose of this hearing. D. Levy described his desire to install 2 or 3 skylights on north side of house. He presented photos showing proposed placement of either 2 skylights (1 in front and 1 in back) or 3 skylights (2 in front and 1 in rear). He described the skylight as being low profile and approximately 21" x 38". M. Penzenik asked how near is neighbor's house is to his house, suggesting that

the building department may be concerned about changes that are within the typical setback. Applicant responded that the separation is about 30 feet approximately. J. Nyberg stated that he visited the site and his two thoughts are: 1) the house is sited on a fairly steep hill and you don't notice the house at all driving by so the placement of the proposed features is not something that stood out to him. Thus, while he was not originally in favor, the type of the house, the setting of the house, and the pitch of the hill has changed his mind. Also, 2) the proposed low profile is less obtrusive and it does make a difference. His preference would be to put 2 in the rear and 1 in the front. J. Worden said we generally have not allowed skylights in a District. M. Penzenik asked about if the proposed uses of the space. Applicant D. Levy explained the use of the space. S. Makowka says we have considered single skylights in the past, but usually only 1. However, he stated that due to the particular siting of this house on a slope, walking down the street the uphill roof isn't a primary façade to begin with. His preference is a 1 and 1 layout. D. Levy described condos at Russell Place where skylights are pretty dominant and it's evident that there are a lot of skylights. In this case it's a larger area and they should blend in more. M. Penzenik asked if he thought about sort of distributing these across both roofs - having 1 on one side and another on the opposite side – D. Levy said front space is disconnected by stair in between. Also, the other façade, looking from Lowell Street, is much more noticeable and would actually detract more if you put one on the other side to be seen from Lowell Street. S. Makowka agreed that the view from Lowell St is more prominent and more important to house. J. Worden said he would prefer 2 not 3 on the side. J. Nyberg felt that 2 was a happy compromise between 3 and none. Any of these houses could use skylights to bring light into these attic spaces. M. Penzenik moved approval of 2 skylights as shown on plans for side, with exact locations to be worked out by monitor prior to installation, manufacturer Velux and sizes as shown on application, J. Nyberg seconded for discussion. Discussion – J. Worden suggested that the Commission note that this approval was predicated on the fact that the proposed location was unique to this property due to it being a secondary roof and to the unusual topographical situation which makes it less prominent than in typical in cases, thus this approval should not be viewed as making a precedent. M. Penzenik modified her motion to include this comment. The modified motion was seconded by J. Nyberg. All voted in favor of the modified motion. Monitor J. Nyberg appointed

ACCOMPANYING DOCUMENTATION: DRAWINGS, PHOTOS, APPLICATION

b. Informal Hearing re: 187 Lowell Street (Grinnell) for roof repair, door change and other renovations. S. Makowka noted that D. Levy was rejoining the Mt. Gilboa Commission and Mr. Smurzynski would step down. S. Makowka began by explaining that most of the items contained in the application qualified for a CONA except for one proposed change which involves moving a the side door around the corner of the back of the house and replacing it with a window. Thus, this is the only item that we really need to discuss tonight. The applicant. C. Grinnell, described that they also were considering the possibility of replacing door with a wall and not having a window in that location as a second option, so he would like to modify the request to be for removal of the door and replacement with either a window or siding only. M. Penzenik said replacing the door opening with a window makes it more harmonious rather than just losing the door and closing up wall. The Applicant noted that the interior design may or may not have room for the window. D. Levy said he would have guessed the 2 window facade would have been original whereas the 3 window façade fells more modern to him and less historically accurate. S. Makowka says he feels both options would be ok and not inappropriate in a district especially given the limited visibility of the proposed change at the rear of the side facade. D. Levy made a motion that this change is so insubstantial in its effect of the District that the Commission can act subject to a 10 day notice. The motion was seconded by J. Cummings, and approved unanimously. D. Levy made a subsequent motion to allow removal of the door as

described in the application and either substitute a matching window or a full wall clad to match existing conditions with all materials, including window if so desired to be approved by monitor prior to installation. Seconded by J. Cummings and approved unanimously. Monitor appointed: S. Makowka

ACOMPANYING DOCUMENTS: DRAWINGS, PHOTOS, APPLICATION

6. Other Business

- a. Preservation Loan Program Update No Update
- b. Outreach to Neighborhoods & Realtors
- c. Updates to AHDC Commissioner Contact Information
- d. Discussion of potential Warrant Article submissions S. Makowka said any change in by-law can be put in right now with the warrant open. Question about enforcement issues should the provisions be updated and streamlined working with Town Counsel. J. Worden agreed and suggested working with Town Counsel. He will coordinate with S. Makowka to get warrant article written. J. Worden moved approval that the Chairman submits a warrant article for this warrant. All voted in favor. The suggestion was made that maybe fences and other items might be addressed as well.

7. OPEN FORUM

Any matter presented for consideration of the Commission shall neither be acted upon, nor a formal decision made the night of the presentation

The owner of 55 Academy Street was present to discuss the construction of an addition to his house at 55 Academy Street. S. Makowka explained the normal HDC process where the applicant presents plans to the HDC, then gets feedback/suggestions for alternatives if necessary, then gets HDC certificate, and then goes to the building department for building permit. Applicant said they thought everything was in order since they got the building department's approval. He explained that he wants an addition to use as an art studio for his wife. The plans approved by Building Dept. were presented along with photos. S. Makowka noted that based on his site visit, while the location of the addition is well set back from the street, it is still visible from Academy Street when looking up the hill. The owner described that additional family space is intention. M. Penzenik asked contractor, Matthew Fischer, how much framing has been done? Response: the framing is basically done. The applicant described that the goal was to have the construction not look like an addition, but to look like it was always part of house. In looking at the plans, Commissioners noted that the windows on one side were not centered and that there appeared to be some more modern elements, for instance - the three doors as opposed to door with skylights. There was also so confusion over the plans provided and whether they represented the addition as built. S. Makowka suggested that the Commission provide feedback on whether a one story addition would be an appropriate thing in this location. M. Penzenik said in terms of the skylight as a light monitor, it wouldn't have been uncommon for a house of that period of time to have a glass conservatory on it. The gang of windows on the elevation facing Academy Street is not a historically appropriate window treatment. He would make same comment though it is less important on the elevation facing D. Baldwin's house, thought smaller gang of windows. M. Penezik said she agrees and it probably should just be a single window centered on the skylight. She does think that the elevation #3 in upper right hand corner looks contrived, although she doesn't have a problem with smaller windows ganged there, the windows to either side are way too tiny and should be more on the size of the one that's there. S. Makowka suggested that it needs to be determined which facades are visible and to what extent. Does the Commission feel it would be appropriate to consider the façade from Academy Street visible and the other two facades are not visible and under our jurisdiction. M. Penzenik suggested that this may be an exceptional case since they weren't informed but S. Makowka disagreed stating that they are in a District and, by bylaw, must follow our guidelines and receive a HDC Certificate. In response to further questions, the owner stated that a rubber roof is proposed but that you won't see it because it is flat; gutters on main house are wooden and the addition will be the same. M. Penzenik felt the porch seems odd since it doesn't run full width but it is not clear that that façade is visible. Applicant stated that they will consider the comments and will submit an application for approval of the work and will be coming in for a formal hearing in January.

ACCOMPANYING DOCUMENTATION: DRAWINGS, PHOTOS, PLANS ONLY

8. REVIEW OF PROJECTS (See project list below)

Project List:

- 1. 11 Westmoreland Avenue (Caruso 01-12M) 6/02 Cohen-COA
- 2. 79 Crescent Hill (Moore, 04-5G) Cohen-CONA
- 3. 75 Westminster Ave. (Dressler, 05-06M) Makowka COA
- 4. 175 Lowell Street (Erickson for Hill, 05-07M) Cohen COA
- 5. 15 Montague Street (Barkans, 05-08M) Cohen CONA
- 6. 105 Westminster Ave. (Orrigo 05-27M) Cohen COA
- 7. 203 Lowell Street (Salocks & Stafford 06-20M) Potter COA
- 8. 123 Westminster Ave. (Urgotis 06-26M) Makowka CONA (Front Steps)
- **9.** 152b Pleasant St. (Cury 07-16P) Worden COA (Fence)
- **10.** 10 Montague St. (Jirak 07-20M) Makowka CONA (Fence Replacement)
- **11.** 3 Westmoreland Ave. (Canty 07-23M) Makowka CONA (Roof & Light)
- **12.** 246 Pleasant St. (Eykamp 07-48P) Makowka CONA (Windows)
- **13.** 149 Pleasant St. (Alberto 07-53P) Penzenik COA (Porch Windows)
- **14.** 23 Maple St. (Town of Arl. 07-55P) Makowka COA (Trim, Siding, Vestibule, Windows)
- **15.** 170 Pleasant St. (Gillis/Kelly 07-56P) Cohen COA (Basement Windows)
- **16.** 72 Westminster Ave. (Colman 08-01M) Cohen COA (Front Porch)
- **17.** 54 Jason Street (Zaphiris 08-7P) Makowka CONA (Front Stairs, Step & Landing)
- **18.** 34 Jason Street (Szymanski 08-09P) Makowka CONA (Deck on Rear)
- 19. 26 Academy Street (Wright 08-19P) Cohen COA (Deck, Landscaping)
- **20.** 274-276 Broadway (Galvin -08-20B) Makowka CONA (Gutters, Roof)
- **21.** 754 Mass. Ave. (Vorlicek 08-31J) Worden COA (Handicap Lift, Stairs, Entry, Door)
- 22. 193 Westminster Ave. (Pemsler 08-33M) Cohen COA (porch, siding removal, stairs)
- 23. 175 Pleasant Street (Lucchese 08-34P) Penzenik COA (fence)
- **24.** 204-206 Pleasant St. (English 08-35P) Penzenik COA (windows, doorway, siding removal)
- 25. 3 Westmoreland Ave. (Canty/Eng 08-39M) Logan COA (ac vent, screening)
- **26.** 87 Pleasant St. (Calvert 08-40P) Makowka CONA (porch deck & railings)
- **27.** 21-23 Central St. (Mitchell/Dyer 08-44C) Makowka- COA (rear addition, stair, landing, roof)
- **28.** 393-395 Mass. Ave. (Barkan 08-45B) Makowka 10 Day COA (Shutters)
- 29. 14 Westmoreland Ave. (Leveille 08-48M) Makowka CONA (Retaining Wall)
- **30.** 25 Avon Place (Smith 09-02A) Cohen COA (Solar Panels)
- **31.** 187 Pleasant Street (Fox 09-03P) Levy COA (Window Removal, Rear Addition)
- **32.** 30 Jason Street (Mallio 09-04J) Makowka CONA (Window Replacement)
- **33.** 28 Academy Street (Rehrig 09-05P) Makowka COA (Chimney, Porch, AC Units, Door)
- **34.** 81 Westminster Ave. (Lemire 09-06M) Makowka CONA (Windows)
- **35.** 187 Lowell Street (JK Construction 09-07) Cohen/Makowka COA (New House, Old House)
- **36.** 184 Westminster Ave. (Kahn 09-10M) Makowka COA (Roof)
- **37.** 215 Pleasant Street (Gruber 09-11P Levy COA (Shed)
- **38.** 160 Westminster Ave. (Jackson 09-12M) Makowka COA (Addition Revision)

- 156 Westminster Ave. (LaFleur/Ehlert 09-13M) Makowka CONA (Driveway, Steps, Landing)
- **40.** 3 Westmoreland Ave. (Canty/Eng 09-17M) Makowka CONA (Driveway)
- **41.** 179 Westminster (Cerundolo 09-20M) Cohen COA (Porch, Trim, Siding Removal)
- **42.** 187 Lowell (JK Construction 09-21M) Cohen/Makowka COA (New House)
- **43.** 203 Lowell Street (Salocks/Stafford 09-22M) Makowka COA (Addition)
- **44.** 37 Jason Street (Lees 09-24J) Cohen COA (Deck)
- **45.** 74 Pleasant Street (St Johns 09-25P) Worden COA (Sign & lighting)
- **46.** 86 Pleasant Street (Coyner 09-26P) Makowka 10 Day COA (shutters)
- 47. 16 Central Street (Piechota -09-28C) Makowka CONA (Roof)
- **48.** 3 Westmoreland Ave. (Eng/Canty 09-30M) Makowka CONA (fence)
- **49.** 79 Crescent Hill Ave. (Diaz 09-31M) Makowka COA (door removal, stoop, window)
- **50.** 35 Central Street (Budne 09-38C) Makowka CONA (Porch-Chimney-Cap)
- **51.** 204 Pleasant Street (Sirah RT 09-39P) Penzenik COA (Rear Façade Changes)
- **52.** 147 Lowell Street (Nyberg 09-41M) Smurzynski COA (Deck)
- **53.** 23 Jason Street (Leary 09-42J) Makowka CONA (Roof)
- **54.** 148-152 Pleasant Street (White 09-44P) Makowka CONA (Clapboard Siding Repair)
- **55.** 10 Montague Street (Jirak 09-46M) Makowka CONA (Garage Deck Demolition)
- 56. 18 Central Street (Berlinski 09-47C) Makowka CONA (Roof)
- **57.** 17 Russell Street (Makowka 09-48R) Cohen COA (Front Door Window)
- **58.** 15A Avon Place (Burke 10-01A) Makowka CONA (Gutters, Downspouts, Soffits, Porch, Facias, Windows)
- **59.** 109 Westminster Ave. (Rines/Pascale 10-03M) Makowka COA (Porch)
- **60.** 15A Avon Place (Burke 10-04A) Makowka COA (Windows)
- 61. 88 Westminster Ave. (Ryan 10-05M) Makowka CONA (Windows on Rear of House)
- **62.** 174 Westminster Ave. (Landwehr/Szaraz 10-06M) Makowka CONA (Wood Window Repair)
- **63.** 10 Montague Street (Jirak 10-07M) Makowka COA (Railings)
- 64. 174 Westminster Ave. (Bush/Sheldon 10-09M) Makowka CONA (Gutters)
- 65. 100 Pleasant Street (Shiffman 10-10P) Makowka CONA (Roof)
- **66.** 45 Jason Street (Hamilton 10-10J) Makowka CONA (Roof)
- 67. 187 Pleasant Street (Fox 10-11P) Makowka CONA (Guters, Siding, Woodwork, Trim)
- **68.** 38 Russell Street (Mishkin 10-12R) Nyberg COA (AC Compressor)
- **69.** 23 Maple Street (Town of Arl. 10-13P) Makowka CONA (Door)
- 70. 17 Russell Street (Makowka/Spring 10-14R) Cohen COA (Railing)
- **71.** 215 Pleasant Street (Gruber 10-15P) Penzenik COA (Garage Door)
- **72.** 187 Lowell Street (J&K Construction 10-16M) Makowka-Cohen COA (Ext. of Old Certif)
- 73. 215 Pleasant Street (Gruber 10-20P) Makowka CONA (Roof)
- 74. 193 Westminster (Pemsler 10-21M) Cohen COA (Windows, Siding)
- **75.** 22 Russell Street (McCabe 10-23R) Cohen CONA (Chimney)
- **76.** 30 Jason Street (Mallio 10-24J) Makowka CONA (Porch-Steps)
- 77. 204 Pleasant Street (Sirah RT 10-26P) Penzenik COA (Garage-Stairs-Siding-Doors)
- **78.** 114 Westminster Ave. (Metzger 10-28M) Makowka CONA (Shingles-Porch-Rafters)
- 79. 114 Westminster Ave. (Metzger 10-29M) Nyberg COA (Windows)
- 16 Avon Place (Capodanno 10-31A) Makowka COA (Windows on Porch-Roof-Window)
- 10 Jason Street (Young-Sullivan 10-32J) Cohen COA (Chimney-Skylite)
- **82.** 239 Pleasant Street (McKinnon 10-33P) Makowka CONA (Roof)
- 83. 272 Broadway (Danieli-Crispin 10-37B) Makowka CONA (Rear Door)
- **84.** 123 Westminster Ave. (Urgotis 10-38M) Makowka CONA (Porch Columns)
- 85. 272 Broadway (Danieli-Crispin 10-39B) Makowka COA (Doors)
- **86.** 272 Broadway (Danieli-Crispin 10-40B) Makowka CONA (Windows)

- 193 Westminster Ave. (Pemsler 10-41M) Cohen COA (Siding Removal-Clapboard-Windows)
- 88. 3 Westmoreland Ave. (Canty-Eng 10-42M) Makowka CONA (Window Sash)
- 89. 246 Pleasant Street (Eykamp 10-43P) Makowka CONA (Windows)
- 90. 14 Westmoreland Ave. (Leveille 10-45M) Makowka CONA (Vinyl Siding Removal-Shingle Repair on Areas Not Visible from Public View)
- 91. 22-24 Avon Place (Sayigh) 10-46A) Makowka CONA (Door Threshold)
- 25 Elder Terrace (Hussain 10-47M) Makowka CONA (Roof, Gutters, Down Spouts)
- 93. 52-54 Westminster Ave. (O'Shea 10-49M) Makowka COA (Door)
- 94. 23 Water Street (Whitford 10-50R) Cohen COA (Addition-Siding-Windows)
- 95. 14 Westmoreland Ave. (Leveille 10-51M) Cohen COA (Siding-Attic Windows)
- **96.** 12 Elder Terrace (Folkers 10-53M) Cohen COA (Garage)
- 97. 24 Jason Street (Smith-Towner 10-54J) Makowka CONA (Stairs-Handrail)
- 98. 17 Pelham Terrace (Choi 10-54P) Makowka COA (Chimney Removal)
- **99.** 17 Pelham Terrace (Choi 10-55P) Makowka CONA (Rear Door-Window-Skylights)
- **100.** 125 Pleasant Street (Abate 10-57P) Makowka CONA (Windows)
- **101.** 160 Westminster Ave. (Jackson 10-58M) Makowka CONA (Fence)
- **102.** 1 Monadnock Road (Starks-Hopeman 10-59P) Makowka CONA (Windows)
- **103.** 7 Avon Place (Davidson 10-60A) Makowka CONA (Window Repair)
- **104.** 19 Westmoreland Ave. (Naar 11-01M) Makowka CONA (Porch-Stairs-Rail-Trim)
- **105.** 8 Wellington Street (Salvation Army 11-02P) Makowka CONA (Roof)
- **106.** 38 Russell Street (Mishkin 11-03R) Nyberg COA (Rear Addition-Attic Window)
- 107. 50 Westmoreland Ave. (Sessa 11-04M) Makowka CONA (Shingles)
- **108.** 215 Pleasant Street (Gruber 11-05P) Makowka CONA (Garage Repair)
- 109. 187 Lowell Street (JK Construction 11-06M) Makowka/Cohen (New Construction)
- **110.** 188-190 Westminster Ave. (Kokubo 11-08M) Penzenik COA (Addition-Windows)
- 111. 69 Crescent Hill Ave. (Bush-Sheldon 11-09M) Makowka (Siding-Deck-Windows)
- **112.** 114 Westminster Ave. (Fleming-Metzger 11-10M) Makowka CONA (Rear Deck)
- 113. 163 Pleasant Street (Davidson 11-11P) Makowka CONA (Fascia Board-Rafter Rails)
- 114. 157 Lowell Street (Stevens 11-12M) Makowka CONA (Railing)
- 115. 69 Crescent Hill Ave. (Bush-Sheldon 11-13M) Nyberg COA (Shingles/Clapboard)
- **116.** 218 Pleasant Street (Plokhii 11-14P) Makowka DENIAL COA (Siding)
- 117. 30 Academy Street (McKee 11-17P) Penzenik COA (Wall)
- **118.** 19 Maple Street (Hirani 11-18P) Penzenik COA (Shed-Garage)
- 119. 20 Prescott Street (Cohen 11-19R) Cohen COA (Addition)
- **120.** 44 Academy Street (Gevalt/Bachrach -11-21P) Penzenik COA (Shed)
- 121. 35 Jason Street (Lynch 11-22J) Makowka COA (Rear Deck and Addition)
- **122.** 35 Central Street (Budne 11-24C) Makowka CONA (Rails-Stairs-Porch)
- 123. 21 Montague Street (Elwell/Nemec 11-25M) Makowka CONA (Fascia-Porch-Rail)
- **124.** 33 Russell Street (Littlewood 11-26R) Makowka CONA (Porch-Gutters-Clapboards)
- **125.** 35 Academy Street (Knoblock 11-27P) Makowka CONA (Porch Repair)
- **126.** 60 Pleasant St., Unit 513 (Engels 11-28P) Makowka CONA (Windows)
- 127. 157 Lowell Street (Stevens 11-32M) Makowka CONA (Fence)
- **128.** 187 Lowell Street (Nyberg 11-33M) Makowka-Cohen COA (New Construction)
- 129. 60 Pleasant Street (Condo Assoc 11-34P) Makowka CONA (Balconies-Facades) –
- 130. 23-29 Academy Street (Chiccarelli-Benn 11-35P) Makowka CONA (Fence)
- **131.** 111 Pleasant Street (Fredieu 11-36P) Makowka CONA (Roof-Downspouts-Gutters-Foundation)
- 132. 20 Russell Street, #1 (Briggs 11-37R) Makowka CONA (Windows)
- **133.** 100 Pleasant St. #31 (Greenfield 11-38P) Makowka CONA (Windows)
- **134.** 170 Pleasant Street (Gillis-Kely 11-39P) Levy COA (Basement Windows)
- **135.** 19 Jason Street (Dargon-Green 11-40J) Cohen COA (Rear Deck-Stairway-Rails on Front)

- **136.** 160 Westminster Ave. (Jackson 11-41M) Nyberg 10 Day COA (Shed)
- **137.** 252 Pleasant Street (Schweich 11-42P) Nyberg 10 Day COA (Walls)
- **138.** 734 Mass. Ave. (Davidson 11-43P) Makowka CONA (Siding-Corner Boards)
- **139.** 742 Mass. Ave. (Davidson 11-44J) Makowka CONA (Facia)
- **140.** 201 Pleasant Street (Kantor 11-45P) Makowka CONA (Eaves-Sills-Facia)
- **141.** 52-54 Westminster Ave. (O'Shea 11-46M) Makowka CONA (Rear Deck/Porch)
- **142.** 19 Academy Street (Masonic Lodge 11-47P) Makowka CONA (Ramp on Rear)
- **143.** 32 Academy Street (Chasteen 11-48P) Makowka CONA (Windows on Rear)

Meeting adjourned 10:10pm

Carol Greeley
Executive Secretary
cc: HDC Commissioners
Arlington Historical Commission, JoAnn Robinson-Chair
Building Inspector, Mr. Michael Byrne
Building Dept., Richard Vallarelli
Planning Dept. and Redevelopment Board, Ms. Carol Kowalski
Massachusetts Historical Commission
Town Clerk
Robbins Library
MIS Department